



THE MATERIAL THEORY OF INDUCTION by John D. Norton

ISBN 978-1-77385-254-6

THIS BOOK IS AN OPEN ACCESS E-BOOK. It is an electronic version of a book that can be purchased in physical form through any bookseller or on-line retailer, or from our distributors. Please support this open access publication by requesting that your university purchase a print copy of this book, or by purchasing a copy yourself. If you have any questions, please contact us at ucpress@ucalgarv.ca

Cover Art: The artwork on the cover of this book is not open access and falls under traditional copyright provisions; it cannot be reproduced in any way without written permission of the artists and their agents. The cover can be displayed as a complete cover image for the purposes of publicizing this work, but the artwork cannot be extracted from the context of the cover of this specific work without breaching the artist's copyright.

COPYRIGHT NOTICE: This Open Access work is published under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 Creative Commons licence, available freely to readers everywhere, at no cost to authors. This means that you are free to copy, distribute, display or perform the work as long as you clearly attribute the work to its authors and publisher, that you do not use this work for any commercial gain in any form, and that you in no way alter, transform, or build on the work outside of its use in normal academic scholarship without our express permission. If you want to reuse or distribute the work, you must inform its new audience of the licence terms of this work. For more information, see details of the Creative Commons licence at: http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

UNDER THE CREATIVE COMMONS LICENCE YOU MAY:

- read and store this document free of charge;
- distribute it for personal use free of charge;
- print sections of the work for personal use;
- read or perform parts of the work in a context where no financial transactions take place.

UNDER THE CREATIVE COMMONS LICENCE YOU MAY NOT:

- gain financially from the work in any way;
- sell the work or seek monies in relation to the distribution of the work:
- use the work in any commercial activity of any kind;
- profit a third party indirectly via use or distribution of the work:
- alter or build on the work outside of normal academic scholarship.

The cover can only be reproduced, distributed, and stored within its function as a cover for this work, and as a complete cover image for the purposes of publicizing this work.



Acknowledgement: We acknowledge the wording around open access used by Australian publisher, **re.press**, and thank them for giving us permission to adapt their wording to our policy http://www.re-press.org

Index

abduction: as argument form, 249, 271; and Darwin, 249, 253-54; and Einstein, 253, 305-12; examples in science, 248, 262-65, 273-76; as form of induction, 19; formal and material approaches, 251, 260; and inference to the best explanation, 247; no universal account of, 248; and notions of explanation, 247-49, 253, 257-58; and Peirce, 253-55; two-step scheme, 251, 267-69, 273, 310, 319, 323, 330. See also inference to the best explanation abductive inference. See abduction Accum, Frederick, 41-42 Adams, John, 209 additivity: of calculi, 383, 396, 435; and chance values, 537; and completely neutral support, 353; countable, 470, 472, 508, 598-99, 593-94; in credences, 15, 396, 398; deviations from, 400, 401-02; divergence additivity, 419; finite, 472, 474-75, 597, 474-80, 508; of a probability measure, 14, 601, 641; of strengths, 379; subadditivity, 399-04, 420; superadditivity, 358, 399-04, 420; violated, 345, 352, 396, 466, 601. See also credences Aharonov, Yakir, 582 AIC. See Akaike Information Criterion Akaike Information Criterion: and coin tosses, 234-39, 243-46; correcting for overfitting, 232; described, 229-30; and d-parameter model, 239; as elaboration of Maximum

Akaike, Hirotogu, 228–29. See also Akaike Information Criterion

model, 239-40

Likelihood Criterion, 226, 228-30; failure of,

242-43; and material theory of induction,

240-41; and model selection, 224-25, 242;

and one-parameter model, 236, 238-40,

243; and probability distribution, 231–32; and simplicity, 12, 243; and zero-parameter

analogical inferences: distinguishing good from bad, 119, 122; as facts, 11, 51, 60, 120, 132–33; good, 120; negative analogy, 125–26, 128, 133, 141; positive analogy, 125–26, 128, 133, 140; prior association, 128; source to target, 125–28, 131–33; as warrants, 11. See also analogy

analogy: as argument form, 10–11, 60, 121; articulation model, 127–30; bare analogy, 119, 121, 124; as criterion for explanation, 258–59; facts of, 60, 135, 142; as form of inference, 51, 120; logic of, 127; material analogy, 129; and material theory of induction, 131; principle of similarity, 133, 142; problems with articulation model, 131–32; problems with two-dimensional approach, 128–29; reasoning by, 119, 122–124, 128; two-dimensional approach, 124–126, 128–29. See also analogical inferences; formal approach to analogy

Aquinas, Thomas, 184 Aristotle, 10, 119, 184 astrology, 154

astronomy: Copernican, 161, 223; as domain of inference, 47, 160; fitting orbits, 175; geocentric and heliocentric, 155–56, 160; Ptolemaic, 223. *See also* Copernicus; Copernican system; Ptolemaic system; Ptolemy;

asymptotic stability, 437, 459–61, 463–64 atoms: atomic theory, 85; liquid drop model of nucleus, 11; model of, 163; as propositions, 438, 445–48, 450, 455–59, 461; radioactive decay of, 590–91

Atwood, Kimball, 97 axiom of choice, 507–08, 521, 546, 547n, 554–56, 567 Bacon, Francis, 322 Banach-Tarski paradox, 547, 548n, 556 barium chloride: monoclinic form, 25; separation from radium chloride, 17, 27; similarity to radium chloride, 27-30, 44-47, barium sulphate, 44. See also barium chloride Bartha, Paul, 119, 125, 127-28, 130, 475, 477 Bayes property, 383. See also Bayes' theorem; Bayesian approach Bayes' theorem: and deductive inferences, 7; and posterior probabilities, 15, 32-33, 66, 76–78, 335–36; and prior probabilities, 3–4, 15, 32–37, 58, 66, 75–79, 335; and probability calculus, 7, 38, 66, 335; ratio form of, 441. See also Bayesian approach; Bayesian epistemology Bayesian analysis. See Bayesian approach Bayesian approach: account of induction, 7; applicability of, 8, 14, 75-76, 80; complications with, 66, 79; and crystallography, 31; distinctiveness of, 14; and Dutch book arguments, 363-64; failure of, 34-39, 76-77, 341-43; inductive incompleteness of, 15, 58; for matching DNA samples, 4; objective, 77–78, 338, 340-42, 381-82, 480; preference for simpler hypotheses, 440; present dominance of, 3, 13, 58; problem of priors, 436-37, 465-66; simplicity, 436, 440-41; subjective, 4, 77-78, 338, 340-42, 382, 465, 485; varieties, 340. See also Bayes' theorem; Bayesian epistemology Bayesian epistemology, 335-36, 338-39. See also Bayes' theorem; Bayesian approach Bayesianism. See Bayesian approach beliefs. See credences Benci, Vieri, 472 Benétreau-Dupin, Yann, 348, 357-58 Besso, Michele, 110 betting: behaviors, 359, 366-67, 373, 375; fair bets, 364, 367, 371-72, 374; quotients, 364-65, 367-75; refusing to bet, 366, 368-69; scenarios, 4, 359, 363, 368, 372, 374-75 Big Bang: and cosmic background radiation, 159-60, 247, 250, 262, 275, 312-19, 341; evidence for, 4, 159-60, 318; and relativistic cosmology, 604; versus steady-state theory, 316-17, 319. See also cosmology black hole, 604 Blackwell, David, 521, 558, 563

Bohm, David, 582 Bohr, Niels, 139, 163 Bondi, Hermann, 16, 520-21, 539-41, 546. See also cosmology; steady-state cosmology Boolean algebra, 446-47, 451-52, 458 Boolean operators, 446, 464 Born, Max, 306, 309 Bosch, Carl, 81 Brandom, Robert, 85-86 Brewster, David, 327 Bridgman, Percy, 365 Brier score, 389-96, 399, 401, 407, 409-10, 421 Brier, Glenn, 390-93 Brigandt, Ingo, 86 British Medical Journal, 114 Byrd, R., 112

calculi of inductive inference: alternatives to probability calculus, 469; appeal of, 438-40; completeness, 436-37; failure of ideal of completeness, 444-45, 465-67; ideal of completeness, 443-44; lack of universality, 467, 469, 603; necessity of incompleteness, 437, 466; neutral initial state, 435-36; nontrivial, 435-36, 465-66; probabilistic, 451-52 "Cathode Rays" (paper by J. J. Thomson), 289-90, 293, 296-97. See also cathode rays; particle theory; Thomson, J. J. cathode rays: as charged particles, 290-91, 293-95; as example of abduction, 276, 289-303; as waves, 290, 292-96; nature of, 289-90. See also "Cathode Rays"; particle theory; Thomson, J. J.

theory; Thomson, J. J. causation, 129–30; multiplicity of causal factors, 179–80 celestial mechanics: eccentric orbits, 203–05;

celestral mechanics: eccentric orbits, 203–05; ellipses, 203–05; gravitation theory, 204; hyperbolas, 203–05; orbital trajectories, 203–04; parabolas, 203–05; perturbations, 208–09; perturbed ellipses, 208–09. See also curve fitting; Newtonian gravitation theory; orbital trajectories

Chibnall, John, 113 childbed fever: cause of, 13, 261, 265–67 COBE satellite, 314 Coherent Admissibility, 411

coin tosses: accumulated results of, 4; and Akaike Information Criterion, 234–39, 243–46; invariances involving, 352; and nonmeasurable sets, 16–17, 521–22, 558–66; and probabilities, 37, 47–48, 352, 485–86; as

Blatt, John, 140-42

probabilistic randomizer, 505-09; principle of indifference, 347; repeated scenarios of, 370 cold fusion, 93, 96, 98-106 comets: energy of, 206-07; orbital trajectories of, 203, 205-06 common salt. See sodium chloride completely neutral support, 348-59; and additivity, 345, 353, 383; and background conditions, 14; and Dutch book, 368-69; and indeterministic physical systems, 604; and invariances, 17, 574, 601-02; and label independence, 520; and principle of indifference, 337 conditionalization, 76, 78, 440, 465, 592, 594 confirmation theory, 19, 253 connectives, 83-86 consilience: as criterion for explanation, 258-60, 278, 282 consistency: as criterion for theory choice, 11, 166-67, 169-71 construct validity, 94n containment principle, 470, 504-05 continual (continuous) reaction of matter, 539_43 controlled trials, 94-95, 112, 114-15 Copernican system, 156; aesthetic superiority of, 157-58; appeal of, 156, 161; argument against by Osiander, 160; versus Ptolemaic system, 158, 223; victory over Ptolemaic, 157-58. See also Copernicus Copernicus: On the Revolutions of the Heavenly Spheres, 157; versus Ptolemy, 156-57. See also Copernican system corpuscular theory of light, 324-30; defined, 325. See also emission theory cosmic background radiation: and Big Bang 159-60, 247, 250, 275, 312-19, 341; competing theories for, 314-19; as example of abduction, 312-19; Penzias and Wilson, 159; thermal character of, 312-15, 317-18 cosmic matter distribution, 584-88 cosmological principle, 80 cosmology: continual creation of matter, 539-43; and cosmic background radiation, 275; and cosmological principle, 80; eternal inflation, 471, 509-10, 512-14; inflationary, 16, 480, 509, 512-14; Newtonian, 17, 583-88, 596-97, 607-10; pre-inflationary, 604; and simplicity, 173. See also Big Bang; steady-state cosmology Coulomb electrostatics, 129

Cournot's Principle, 486

Cox, Richard, 338, 360, 377-80 credences: accuracy of, 14-15, 388, 395, 397, 407-08; and additivity, 15, 404, 425, 429; dominating, 396-98, 400-02, 406-07; eliciting, 393-95; "immodest," 417-18; non-additive, 404; non-probabilistic, 388-89, 394-97, 412-14, 417-18; probabilistic, 388-89, 394-97, 408-15, 417-18, 420; and probabilities, 8-9, 14, 359; and probability calculus, 396; and strengths of inductive support, 341; subadditive, 399-04, 408, 412, 420, 426, 429-30; superadditive, 399-04, 408, 412, 420, 426, 429-30. See also additivity criteria for explanation: analogy, 258-59; consilience, 258-60; simplicity, 258-59. See also notions of explanation; Thagard, Paul crystallographic forms: cubic system, 24-26; dimorphism, 33, 42; and enumerative induction, 57; fluorspar, 24-25; Haüy's account, 40-42; heavy spar, 44; isomorphism, 30, 44-47; monoclinic system, 25-26, 30, 39n, 66; octahedral, 24-25; polymorphism, 33, 42-43, 45, 47, 51; process of cleavage, 24-25; properties of, 9; regular system, 24; system of classification, 23-24; trimorphism, 42 Curie, Marie: 1911 Nobel Prize address, 30; doctoral dissertation, 27; extraction of radium, 26-28, 39n, 40; generalization about radium, 46-47; hypothesis about radium, 36; inference from radium sample, 9, 28-30, 37-38, 59, 65; observations about radium. 44-47. See also radium chloride Curie, Pierre, 27 curve fitting: constant, 189, 190, 202; cubic, 190, 200-01, 232-34; defined, 196; error model, 196-98; linear, 189-90, 200-02, 232-34; and material theory of induction, 195-98; and model selection, 225, 227; and Moody chart, 182; and orbital trajectories, 202-11; order hierarchy, 202; overfitting, 12, 190; parametrization, 199-202; polynomial curves, 189-90, 200, 202, 232; problems with, 193; quadratic, 189-90, 200-02, 232; quartic, 190, 200-01, 232-33; and simplicity, 175, 189, 191, 193; sinusoidal curves, 12; and theory of relativity, 211. See also simplicity; orbital trajectories; tides

Darwin, Charles: and abduction, 249, 253–54; account of the eye, 274, 279–80; defense

Czech book, 367

of abduction, 252, 256, 288; description of natural selection, 277–78; influence of Lyell on, 285, 287; influence of wave theory on, 324; influence of Whewell on, 278; and intelligent creation, 13, 276, 279–82; and notions of explanation, 282–83; voyage on the Beagle, 285. See also natural selection; On the Origin of Species

Davisson, Clinton, 302
Dawid, Richard, 594
Dawkins, Richard, 113; *The God Delusion*, 113
Day, Timothy, 249
de Broglie waves, 302
Decomposition, 419–20

deduction: *all-some* schema, 5; and analogical inferences, 127, 132, 135; contrast with inductive inferences, 56, 62–63; deductions from the phenomena, 51, 269; and deductive arguments, 136; and deductive validity, 50–51; deductive fallacy, 109, 124; distinguishing good from bad, 82; good, 5, 82; with hidden premise, 65; and hypothetico-deductive confirmation, 160; logic of, 82, 85, 91, 106n, 124; non-contextual, 83, 85; universal principle of, 5, 6, 91–92; validity of, 50–51; warrants for, 5–8, 46. *See also* hypothetico-deductive confirmation

deductive inferences. *See* deduction deductive structure, 437, 445–48, 455, 465 de Finetti, Bruno: and betting scenarios, 359, 363–65, 374–75; and Dutch book arguments, 337, 360; and infinite lottery, 485, 504; and probabilities, 393, 471–72; as subjective

De Morgan's laws, 83 De Vito, Scott, 242 Department of Energy (US), 100–01 determinism, 573; general idea of, 575; temporal,

deterministic physical systems, 575–76 deuterium, 99, 101, 103–06 Diaconis, Persi, 521, 558, 563 Dirac, Paul, 195 Divergence Additivity, 419 Divergence Continuity, 419–20

Bayesian, 340

dome: as example of indeterminism, 576–77, 594–95; as Newtonian system, 577

dominance: condition of, 409–11; dominance argument, 388, 394–98, 401, 414–17; dominance relations, 399, 406–07, 424–28; theorem, 14

dominoes: infinite domino cascade, 17, 573, 579–81; toppling of, 605–07 Douglas, Heather, 153n Drake, Stillman, 70, 74 Dutch book arguments, 14, 363–77

Earman, John, 576
Ehrenfest's theorem, 303
Einstein, Albert: and abduction, 253, 306; and anomalous motion of Mercury, 305–12; appraisal of Miller experiment, 106n, 108–10; arguments against Newton, 161–62; Herbert Spencer Lecture, 192; as mathematical Platonist, 71–72, 191–92; and notion of simplicity, 191, 193–95

—theory of relativity: completion of, 305; complexity of, 252–53; cosmological constant, 584; and the ether, 122 and Mercury, 4, 210–11, 253; and von Neumann, John 195; special relativity, 107, 329; versus zodiacal light, 274–75

electrons: and atoms, 138–39; discovery of, 289; and ellipses, 12, 203–05; orbit of, 141; as spin-half particles, 82, 164; spin of, 17, 82, 469; wave-like properties of, 275; as waves, 302–05; and perturbed ellipses, 208–09. See also celestial mechanics

emission theory of light, 274, 325–30; defined, 325; and evidential debt, 330; versus wave theory, 325–30. *See also* corpuscular theory; wave theory

Energy Research Advisory Board (ERAB), 100-01, 103-05

enthymeme, 50, 65

enumerative induction: authorizing too much, 59; of breathtaking scope, 9; contrast with *all-some* schema, 6, 22; and crystallography, 50; early attempt at, 5; failure of, 438; and Haüy's principle, 68; and Marie Curie, 38; schema of, 29–31, 39, 47, 57

epistemic values and virtues, 11; and skepticism, 162; and Thomas Kuhn, 168; as criteria for theory choice, 154–55, 169; and evidential relations, 159; and inductive support, 158, 161; and material theory of induction, 158; as means and ends, 154; as surrogates for facts, 155, 159; role in assessing evidence, 153; role in inductive inference, 162; as warrants for induction, 159. *See also* theory choice; values; value judgments

eternal inflation: defined, 509-10; and label 120-22, 133-137; Siderius Nuncius, 133; Two independence, 509; measure problem, 471, New Sciences, 70, 72, 74-75 509-15 Galton, Francis, 111 ether, 107-10, 122 gambler's streak, 595-96 ether-wave theory. See wave theory gauge systems, 582-83, 601-02 Euclid, 72 Germer, Lester, 302 Euclidean geometry, 195 The God Delusion, 113. See also Dawkins, Euclidean space, 584 Richard Eva, Benjamin, 348 Gödel, Kurt, 444 evidential debt: and abduction, 268; and Charles Goedel's theorem, 557 Lvell, 289; defined, 251; and inference to the Gold, Thomas, 16, 520-21, 539. See also best explanation, 268; and natural selection, cosmology; steady-state cosmology 278-79, 282-83; and Newtonian theory, 311; Goldstein, Eugen, 293 and theory of relativity, 307, 310-11; and wave Grand Unified Theory, 508 theory, 330 gravitational potential, 17 Guth, Alan, 509-14 evolution, 1, 2 explanatory virtues: Lipton, Peter, 310; loveliness, 310-12; oxygen and phlogiston, H. pylori, 93, 96-97 321, 323 Haber-Bosch process, 81 Extension Theorem, 527 Haber, Fritz, 81 external considerations, 15. See also external Hacking, Ian, 312-13 inductive content Hájek, Alan, 367 external inductive content, 34, 36, 442-43, 466. Hale, George Ellery, 193 See also external considerations Hall, Asaph, 210, 308-09; modified law of attraction, 210 Harman, Gilbert, 255 fallacies: analogical, 122-23; deductive, 50, 109, 124; gambler's streak, 595-96; inductive, 6 Harmonic functions, 587-88 Feyarabend, Paul, 7 Harper, William, 242 Fleischmann, Martin, 99, 102 Harris, William, 112 fluid flow in pipes, 181-83, 198. See also Haüy, René Just, 29, 40-41; account of crystalline Reynolds analogy shapes, 40-42. See also Haüy's Principle Ford, William 42, 44 Haüy's Principle, 9, 43, 63, 68; strong, 50, 51; formal approach to analogy: and bare analogy, weakened, 39n, 43, 59, 65. See also Haüy, René 124, 128; development of, 119, 124; and material approach, 130, 142; problems Hawking, Stephen, 114 with, 122, 129, 131-32, 142; requirement for Hempel, Carl, 265 success, 129-31. See also analogy Herschel, John, 322-23 Forster, Malcolm, 223, 242-43 Hertz, Heinrich, 290, 292-93, 295, 297 Fourier analysis, 202, 211–12 Hesse, Mary, 119, 124-127, 129 frequencies of outcomes: and chance, 488, 495, Hilbert space, 359 498-502; and probabilities, 470, 497, 502-03, History of the Inductive Sciences, 29, 326-27. See 554, 592; relative frequencies, 16, 474, 479, also Whewell, William 494-95, 594 Hooke's laws, 578 Fresnel, Augustin, 326 Horsten, Leon, 472, 477 Freundlich, Erwin, 307-09 Hoyle, Fred, 16, 520-21. See also cosmology; Frisch, Otto, 139 steady-state cosmology Hubble, Edwin, 269-70 Galilean spaces, 161-62 Hutter, Marcus, 79 Galileo, Galilei: The Assayer, 71; and invariance Hutton, James, 285 under units of time, 10, 74-75; law of fall, Huygens, Christiaan, 74-75, 325

70-73, 80, 181; mountains on moon, 11,

hydrogen: atoms of, 98, 138–39, 483; bombs, 98; and deuterium, 99

hyperbolas, 12, 203–05. *See also* celestial mechanics; orbital trajectories

hypotheses: competing, 12–13, 60, 76–77, 173; descriptive simplicity of, 175–78; evaluating probability of, 32–33

—favored hypotheses: adequate to the evidence, 12, 60, 268; authorized inference to, 273; competing foils, 275–76, 330–31; establishing superiority of, 275–76, 330–31; and evidential debt, 251; failure of competitor, 13, 60; falsity of, 3; multiple, 77; preference for simpler hypotheses, 439–40, 442–44

hypothetico-deductive confirmation: as account of induction, 159; augmenting, 452; basic notion of, 451; defined, 159; problem with, 155, 160–62; repairing, 159–62. *See also* deduction

implicit definitions, 449–54 imprecise probabilities, 14, 344–46, 356–60 indeterminism: among components of a system, 581–88, 596–99; and degrees of freedom, 578, 581; elimination of, 577; and physics, 595–96; without physics, 583. *See also* indeterministic physical systems

indeterministic physical systems, 17, 469, 515; common characteristic, 573; commonness of, 576; and degrees of freedom, 573; and empirical observation, 594–96; of infinite three-dimensional crystals, 578; and probabilities, 594–96. *See also* indeterminism

induction: and abduction, 12, 247-48; account by Bayesian analysis, 7, 38, 79, 339, 341-43; ampliative nature of, 9, 19, 56, 61-62, 65; analogy as form of, 58, 119, 131; axioms governing, 570; and bare analogy, 123, 128; and belief, 335-36; of breathtaking scope, 26; calculus governing, 342-43; appeal of, 438-40; example of, 448-52; failure of universal, 437, 469, 603; formal analysis within, 36; in particular domains, 466-67, 469; and restrictions, 346; comprehensive account of, 153; concerning crystalline forms, 43-45; concerning genetic mutations, 616-20; concerning spin of electrons, 615, 618-21; conclusions of, 6; contextual nature of, 8, 47; contrast with deductive inferences, 56, 62-63: and controlled trials, 94; and countably infinite sets, 519; dependence on background

assumptions, 302; as distinct from deductive inferences, 42, 50-52; distinguishing good from bad, 23, 30, 61, 142; and epistemic values and virtues, 155, 162, 261; and factual propositions, 7; failure of universal schemas of, 22, 57-59, 653; formal approaches to, 21-23, 29, 119-20, 142, 187, 654; foundational problems of, 382, 436; general inductive principles of, 109, 115; good, 30, 50, 55, 61; and Hume's problem, 654; and imprecise probability, 359; and indeterministic systems, 581-83, 589; and inductive risk, 48, 64, 123, 186; and inference to the best explanation, 12, 247-48, 266, 270; and the law of fall, 70-72, 75; licit, 52, 57, 59; limitations of, 132, 557–58, 569, 575; literature on, 2, 10, 52; local character of, 7, 16, 47, 56, 68; modern accounts of, 22; mystery of, 61-62; and nonmeasurable sets, 521; non-trivial, 599; no universal rules for, 7, 159, 335, 653; powers of, 55-56, 61-62; premises of, 6, 51, 63, 65; and probabilistic facts, 48; and probabilistic logic, 618; and probability calculus, 443-45, 466, 469, 575; probability measures in, 548, 604-05; qualitative and quantitative approaches to, 9; and replicability, 90; and reproducibility, 112; schemas for, 5, 10; and simplicity, 60, 173-74; and skeptical relativism, 153-54; standard collections of, 59-61; and strengths of support, 581–82, 603–04; terms for, 19–20; theories of, 3, 40, 79; universal induction, 79, 90; universal principle of, 90, 109; and Vitali sets, 553; warranted by facts, 7, 23, 46, 65-68, 159, 196, 613. See also calculi of inductive inference; enumerative induction; inductive import; inductive logic; inductive risk

inductive import: confusion over, 100; determined by background facts, 93–94; and Einstein, 109; and inductive logic, 462; and Mercury, 311; replication without inductive import, 106–15. See also induction; inductive logic

inductive inferences. *See* induction inductive logic: and asymptotic stability, 460–62; and completely neutral support, 353, 574, 604; constraints on, 454; and continuum-sized sets, 519–21; and deductive logic, 81–82; and deductive structure, 445; deductively definable, 454–57, 464; and density operators, 628–30, 638, 647; for entangled electrons, 647; failure of universally

applicable, 56, 116, 241; formal, 283; and formal approach to induction, 22, 39; general principle of, 159; generalization, 43, 45 and Gödel, 444; and Haüy's principle, 67 and imprecise probabilities, 360; and infinite lottery machine, 470, 481-90, 519-21, 537, 541; and label independence, 494, 539; material, 283; non-additive, 337, 601; and nonmeasurable sets, 554; non-probabilistic, 16, 346, 514, 571, 618-19; objectivity of, 637; and prior probabilities, 382; and probabilistic randomizers, 636, 508; and probability calculus, 471; and probability measure, 638-39; and problem of probabilities, 343; and replicability of experiment, 89-90; for a roulette wheel, 638; and simplicity, 187; and ultrafilter logic, 522;

—probabilistic: applicability of, 575; compared to quantum inductive logic, 614–16, 627–28, 648, 650–52; and electrons, 620; and genetic mutations, 616; necessity of, 361, 637; prevalence of, 613

—quantum: and density operators, 638; and disanalogies, 651; and electrons, 618–20, 628; and genetic mutations, 618; and violation of real-valued functions, 345; compared to probabilistic inductive logic, 613–16, 627–28, 648, 650–52; strengths of support for, 367; warranted by facts in a domain, 343, 470, 599, 620, 651; weak, 17, 532, 559, 570. See also induction; inductive inferences; material theory of induction

inductive risk: and background assumptions, 51n; in chemistry, 29; controlling, 49; in crystallography, 45; degrees of, 44n, 81; differing conclusions, 44; and Galileo, 136; inescapability of, 123, 132; and probabilistic analysis, 66; unique forms of, 47; with warranted inductive inference, 64. See also induction

Infection and Immunity (journal), 89 inference to the best explanation: as argument form, 250, 271; canonical examples, 262–65, 273–76; credentials in science, 252; and Charles Lyell, 286; and cosmic background radiation, 312–19; defined, 247–251; and Albert Einstein, 305–12; explanatory relations, 60; as form of induction, 51; and Gilbert Harman, 255–56; and material theory of induction, 271; no universally applicable schema, 273; notion of explanation,

257–58; and Peter Lipton, 13, 260–62, 274; problems with, 12–13, 22, 48, 250, 438; and Paul Thagard, 256–58; two-step scheme, 251, 267–69, 310, 319, 323, 330–31; vagueness of, 58–59; visceral appeal of, 248–49; and William Whewell 258–59. *See also* abduction; Lipton, Peter

infinite lottery machines: chance properties of, 470, 478, 523; and countably infinite outcomes, 469, 519, 522; difficulties with, 471–72; fairness of, 472–73, 503, 522; and label independence, 475, 477–78, 481, 489–91; in the literature, 470–71; logic of, 345, 359, 481–90, 508, 519–21, 537–39, 553–54; and non-standard calculus, 470; and probability measures, 470–71, 478–79; physical properties of, 470–71

invariances: and coin tossing, 352; from ignorance, 352–53; under negation, 351–52, 602–03; from positive warrant, 352–53; under redescription, 348–50, 601–02 Isaacs, Rufus, 535

Jaynes, Edwin, 14, 338, 342, 360, 377–82, 480 Jeffreys, Harold, 441, 443 Joyce, James, 410–12, 417–18 Jupiter, 209

Kaufman, M., 316

Kelly, Kevin, 180
Kepler's laws: area law, 204; planetary motion, 269
Keynes, John Maynard, 347–49, 379
Khalifa, Kareem, 249
Kincaid, Harold, 249
Kolmogorov axioms, 437, 449, 450, 452
Kolmogorov, Andrey, 344–45, 486–87, 526, 560
Kuhn, Thomas: Kuhn loss, 321; Matchette
Lecture, 155, 165–71; obfuscation by, 162, 165–68; and skeptical relativism, 169; and theory choice, 155; *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, 165–66, 168
Kullback-Leibler discrepancy, 230

label independence: and choosing without favor, 471–73; compatibility with probabilistic logic, 520; condition of, 470; and continuum-sized sets, 520, 522, 523; defined, 470, 473; and infinite lottery machines, 475, 477–78, 481, 489–91; metrically adapted, 520, 535–37, 539, 545, 553; and restriction on permutations,

526; and roulette wheels, 473–74; requirement of, 473, 524; unrestricted requirement, 553; weakening of, 520, 524

label permutation: and continuum-sized sets 520, 523; defined, 473; and infinite lottery machines, 476, 479, 481; and roulette wheels, 474

Laplace's equation, 608 Lavoisier, Antoine, 320-23 Layzer, David, 316 Le Verrier, Urbain, 209 Leibovici, Leonard, 114-15 Leitgeb, Hannes, 411 Lenard, Philipp: and abduction, 275, 290, 293; argument against particle theory, 293-96; cathode rays as waves, 290, 292-96 Levi-Civita, Tullio, 195 Lipton, Peter, 260-62, 265, 267, 274, 310 Lloyd, Humphrey, 327-28 Lorentz force law, 290 Lorentz, Hendrick, 194 loveliness as explanatory virtue, 310-12 Lyell, Charles: and catastrophist theories, 286-88; and evidential debt, 289; influence on Darwin, 285; summary of approach, 286. See also Principles of Geology; uniformitarian geology

Mach, Ernst, 180-81

Maher, Patrick, 376-77

Malament, David, 609-10

Manchak, John, 578 Manhattan project, 164 masses and springs: as example indeterminism, 577-78; as Newtonian system, 577-78; temporal behavior of, 578 material theory of induction: and analogy, 60, 131-33; and background assumptions, 302; and curve fitting, 196-98; as distinct from deductive inference, 50-52; as distinct from other approaches, 5; and Dutch book argument, 367; and epistemic virtues and values, 153-55, 158-59; and formal approaches, 260; and foundational problem of induction, 382; and Hume's problem, 654; and inductive logic, 651; and inference to the best explanation, 247, 260, 271, 273; foundational argument for, 62-68; main ideas of, 7-9, 46-50; regress problem in, 656; relation to Akaike Information Criterion,

240-43; and replication of experiment, 98;

and simplicity, 166, 173, 186; and size of domains, 81; stated and illustrated, 19–20; summary of case for, 55–57; terminology, 17–18; versus formal approaches, 57, 59; and warranting facts, 61, 115–16, 188, 195, 481, 534, 574–75. *See also* induction; inductive logic; simplicity

Mathematical Foundations of Quantum Mechanics, 195. See also von Neumann, John Maximum Likelihood Criterion: defined, 227; as elaboration of Akaike Information Criterion, 226, 228

McCarthy, John, 393 McMullin, Ernan, 170–71 measure theory, 506, 526 Mercury: advancing orbit of, 209

—anomalous motion: account by Erwin Freundlich, 307–09; and Newtonian gravitation theory, 305, 307; explained by theory of relativity, 4, 210–11, 253, 263, 268, 306; explained by zodiacal light, 274; perihelion of, 211, 253, 274, 305–06; perturbations of, 209–10, 310

Mill, John Stuart, 255; methods of, 255, 266–67 model selection: and Akaike Information
Criterion, 225, 242; best fitting, 226–27; defined, 225; *d*-parameter model, 238–39; one-parameter model, 235–40; overfitting, 224–29; and simplicity, 223–26; and statistical noise, 225–26; two-parameter model, 242; zero-parameter model, 234–35, 239–40 modus ponens, 20n, 84, 124, 439

monotonicity, 352 Moody chart, 181–82, 198. *See also* curve fitting Moody, Lewis, 181 Myrvold, Wayne, 242

Narlikar, Jayant, 316
National Oceanic and Atmospheric
Administration (NOAA), US, 218–20
natural selection: aesthetics elegance of, 283;
complexity of, 270, 277–78; and evidential
debt, 278–79, 282–83; and independent
creation, 279–82, 285; obstacles facing,
278–80, 282; summary of, 277–78; warranted
acceptance of, 284–85. See also Darwin,
Charles; On the Origin of Species
necessary conditions: for strengths of inductive
support, 377–81
Neptune, 209, 311

Neptune, 209, 311 New York Times, 193 Newcomb, Simon, 210, 308

Newton, Isaac: accused by Einstein of ad hocery, 161; and gravity, 187–88; corpuscular theory of light, 324–30; *Principia*, 51, 176, 187; "Rules of Reasoning in Philosophy," 176–77, 184–87. *See also* Newtonian gravitation theory; Newtonian cosmology; Newtonian physics; Newtonian potentials; Newtonian systems Newtonian cosmology, 17, 583–88, 596–97, 607–10

Newtonian gravitation theory: and elliptical orbits, 305; as example of indeterminism, 573; and gravitational constant G, 191, 582–83; and indeterministic systems, 573, 583–85; inverse square law of, 269, 309; Mercury's motion explained by, 307; perturbations explained by, 208–09; potentials of, 588; probability of, 7. See also Newton, Isaac; Newtonian cosmology; Newtonian physics; Newtonian potentials; Newtonian systems Newtonian physics, 311, 595

Newtonian potentials, 17, 573–74, 584, 586–88, 598, 608

Newtonian systems, 577–78 no-go results, 463–65

notions of explanation: and abduction, 253, 257–58; attempts to define, 22, 257–58; elusiveness

58; attempts to define, 22, 257–58; elusiveness of, 13, 251; and favored hypotheses, 330; heterogeneity of, 248–49, 260; and induction, 3; varied and vague, 58. *See also* criteria for explanation

nuclear reactions: fission, 98, 139–40, 142, 163; fusion, 98–99, 101–02, 104–05, 188. *See also* cold fusion

Ockham, William of, 183–84; Ockham's razor 174–76, 183–84, 316

On the Origin of Species, 256; analogical reasoning in, 121; and abduction, 254; argument of, 121, 252, 256, 277–78, 281–82; as example of abduction 276–85; influence of wave theory on 324; similarity to Charles Lyell's argument, 287–88. See also Darwin, Charles; natural selection

On the Revolutions of the Heavenly Spheres, 157. See also Copernicus

orbital trajectories: elliptical orbits, 207–08; perturbed orbits, 207–11. *See also* celestial mechanics; curve fitting oxygen: oxygen chemistry, 320–24; oxygen theory, 320–21; and phlogiston, 320–24; and weight, 322; and William Whewell, 323

parabolas, 203–05, 440. *See also* celestial mechanics; orbital trajectories paradoxical decompositions, 16, 521, 543–48 parsimony: aesthetic of, 158; failure of, universal principle of, 224; principle of, 175, 177–78, 180, 188, 224; of the world, 241. *See also* simplicity

particle theory: cathode rays, 275, 289, 295; failure of, 295; fit with experimental results, 290–91, 298–99; versus wave theory, 297–99

Partridge, Bruce, 315–17
Pauli, Wolfgang, 306, 309
Peano's axioms, 444
Peebles, P. J. E. "Jim," 317–18
Peirce, Charles, 253–55, 260
Penzias, Arno, 247, 275, 313, 319, 539
perfect cosmological principle, 539, 546
Pettigrew, Richard, 360, 411, 419
Philosophy of Natural Science, 265. See also
Hempel, Carl

Philosophy of Science (journal), 162 phlogiston: and levity, 322–23; and oxygen, 320– 24; phlogiston chemistry, 320–23; phlogiston theory, 320–22; and Whewell, 323

Physical Cosmology, 317. See also Peebles, P. J. E. "Jim"

pocket universes, 480, 510–11, 514 Poisson's equation, 608–10 Pons, B. Stanley, 99, 102 Popper, Karl, 180

posterior probabilities: and Bayes' theorem, 335–36, 344, 441; fixed, 465n

Precht, J., 45

Primer on Determinism, 576. See also Earman, John Principia, 51, 176, 187. See also Newton, Isaac

principle of indifference, 346–48, 350, 355

Principles of Geology: and catastrophist theories, 286–88; as example of abduction, 276, 285–89; impact on Darwin, 285; and notions of explanation, 285–86; methodological discussion, 286. See also Lyell, Charles; uniformitarian geology

Principles of Physical Cosmology, 318. See also Peebles, Phillip

prior probabilities: and arbitrariness, 381–82; and Bayesianism, 335, 435; distribution,

340, 440–42, 466; necessity of, 382; one correct, 340; problem of, 381; ratio of, 441; unambiguous, 341; washed out, 33–34, 37, 465n

probabilistic law, 590-92, 596

probabilities: 336, 339, 348, 357-58; acceptance or rejection, 382-83; additivity of, 14, 16, 470, 483, 508, 601; and chance properties, 478; and coin tosses, 37, 47-48; conditional, 335, 648; and continuum-sized outcome sets, 520; dominance of, 395-99; necessity of, 337-38, 360-62, 382, 387-89, 395, 410-11, 423; no-memory property of, 590; as strengths of support, 574, 589-90, 599-600; and nonadditive logic, 594; and nonmeasurable sets, 521; and pocket universes, 480-81; necessity of, 478; normalization, 574; representation of indeterminacy, 17; strengths of support, 575, 603-05; uniform, 574; and volumes in space, 597-99. See also prior probabilities: posterior probabilities

probability calculus: additivity of, 396, 601; axioms of, 336–38, 340, 352, 365, 369, 371–73; and Bayesianism, 335, 383; and beliefs, 364; and Brier score, 392; computational rules of, 338, 377, 379; and credences, 396; and induction, 335; as incomplete, 436; as "logic of science," 342; limits of, 343, 435; problems with, 382; success of, 536; weakening of, 345

Probability Theory: The Logic of Science, 342. See also Jaynes, Edwin

protons, 138, 140

Pruss, Alexander, 472, 506

Ptolemaic system, 156; versus Copernican, 157, 223. *See also* Ptolemy

Ptolemy: versus Copernicus 156. *See also* Ptolemaic system

Pythagoras, 411, 535-36, 557

quantum measurement, 17, 576 quantum mechanics, 60, 114, 141, 195, 302, 615, 620

quantum theory, 17, 163, 191, 291, 302–03, 614–32, 636–38, 647–50

radioactivity, 27

radioactive decay: law of, 590; probabilistic analysis of, 591

radium chloride: and barium chloride, 27–30, 44–46, 49; crystalline form of, 44, 46, 59; crystallographic properties of, 9, 27, 38; isomorphism of, 45; monoclinic form, 39n, 66; and Marie Curie, 26–27, 36; separation from uranium, 26–28

Ramsey, Frank, 337, 360, 363, 365

randomization, 60-61, 69, 94-95, 112, 114-15

Rathmanner, Samuel, 79

Rayleigh scattering, 85

recession of galaxies, 179, 269

repeatability of experiment, 89–91, 95, 97. See also replicability; reproducibility

replicability of experiment: defined, 89–91; evidential significance of, 60; import of, 90, 93; failure of, 10, 91–93, 98–104, 106–07, 115; and induction, 51; and material analysis, 93–96; as "scientific gold standard," 10; success of, 10, 91–93, 96–98, 111–13, 115. See also repeatability; reproducibility

reproducibility of experiment. *See* replicability; repeatability

Reynolds analogy: defined, 137–38; for fluid flow, 120, 133, 137, 145–46, 148–49; heat transfer, 138, 143–149; modern, 146–50; momentum transfer, 138, 143, 144–47, 149; original, 144–45; technical details, 143–50. *See also* fluid flow in pipes; transport phenomena

Reynolds, Osborne, 137, 145–46. See also

Reynolds analogy Roberts, Bryan, 578

Roche, William, 249

Romé de l'Isle, 29

Rosenkrantz, Roger, 409

Rosenthal, Jeffrey, 560

roulette wheel, 473-74, 595-96, 615, 638

Rudner, Richard, 155, 162-65, 168, 170-71

Runge, C., 45

Russell set, 555

Russell's paradox, 555

Rutherford, Ernest, 28–29, 40, 45–46

Salmon, Wesley, 67

Savage, Leonard, 360, 375

saving the appearances, 156, 158. *See also* saving the phenomena

saving the phenomena, 156, 160–61, 322. *See also* saving the appearances

Schervish, Mark, 416

Schrödinger equation, 303

scoring rules: and accuracy of credences, 388; choice of, 388–89, 398–99, 408–12, 420, 423; and frequencies, 390–92; literature on, 388–

90, 423; multiplicity of, 423; and probabilistic Statistical Reasoning with Imprecise Probabilities, credences, 418, 423; and probabilities, 389, 373. See also Walley, Peter 418, 423; quadradic, 420–23; strictly proper, steady-state cosmology, 16, 247, 276, 316-19, 390, 412-20, 423, 431-32; and subjective 483, 520-21, 539. See also cosmology; Bondi, Bayesianism, 389; vindications of, 387; with 0 Hermann; Hoyle, Fred; Gold, Thomas < n < 1,403-05 with n = 1,405-07; with n > 1, Steinhardt, Paul, 512-14 399-403, 424-30 string theory, 114 Sellars, Wilfrid, 85 strontium sulphate, 44 Selten, Reinhard, 420-23 The Structure of Scientific Revolutions, 165-66, 168. See also Kuhn, Thomas Semmelweis, Ignaz, 13, 261, 265-67 Shafer-Dempster theory, 358-59, 411-12, 435, Studies in History and Philosophy of Science, 52 Sturms, Edmund, 103-05 Shankland, R. S., 110 Symmetry, 409-10, 422 Shapiro, Alan, 326 Siderius Nuncius, 133. See also Galileo, Galilei tail events, 558-66 simplicity: and Bayesian analysis, 436, 440-41, temporally indeterministic systems, 575, 589-94 443; and counting entities, 174-76, 183, Thagard, Paul, 256-60, 320, 324 185-86; as criterion for explanation, 258-59; The Assayer, 71. See also Galileo, Galilei theory choice, 154-55, 166-67, 169 as criterion for theory choice, 11, 166-67, 169-70; descriptive simplicity, 183, 188-95, theory of evolution, 277, 341. See also natural 202; as economy of expression, 180-81; in selection evidential assessment, 58, 153; as evidential theory of gases, 185 truism, 186-87; explanation for popular theory of relativity: aesthetics of, 307; complexity appeal of, 173; in Galileo's reasoning, 70-71; of, 252-53, 270; correction to Newtonian motions, 306; and curve fitting, 211; and as grounds for inference, 51, 60; in heuristic search, 180; of hypotheses, 175-78; inductive the ether, 122; and evidential debt, 307, power of, 159; and material theory of 310; explanation of motion of Mercury, 4, induction, 186-87; metaphysics of, 241, 243; 210-11, 253, 263, 306-07, 311; explanation in model selection, 223-26; ontic simplicity, of curvature of space-time, 80-81; extension 183-84; pragmatic justifications of, 178-82; as by Hermann Weyl, 311-12; and Miller surrogate for facts, 159, 169, 173-76, 178, 224. experiment, 93; popularizations of, 194, See also parsimony 306; simplicity of, 310; special relativity, 107, skepticism: and cold fusion, 101; dogmatic, 34, 329; versus zodiacal light, 274-75. See also 36; and epistemic virtues and values, 153-55, Einstein, Albert 162, 169-70; inductive, 11; and Kuhn, 155; thermal background radiation. See cosmic and Thomson, 297; prior, 35; radical, 155 background radiation Smith, Cedric, 373 Thirring, Hans, 109 Thompson, William, 212, 218 Snow, John, 179 Sober, Elliot, 174, 223, 242, 249 Thomson, J. J.: and abduction, 302; argument Soddy, Frederick, 45 against wave theory, 292, 296; and cathode sodium chloride, 24, 29 rays, 275-76, 289-303; "Cathode Rays," 289, Solomon, Monica, 75n 293, 297; and notions of explanation, 291. See also cathode rays; particle theory Solomonoff, Ray, 79 space-time, 72, 81, 604 tides: astronomical effects, 217; complications in tidal analysis, 216-17; compound tides, 217; Space-Time-Matter, 306-07. See also Weyl, Hermann and curve fitting, 12, 211; harmonic analysis of, 175, 211-20; harmonic constituents, spontaneous movement, 17, 574, 577-79, 581, 591-94, 599-600 218-19; neap tides, 214-15; overtides, 217; Stanford, Kyle, 251 spring tides, 214; tidal bulges, 213-14, 216; Stanton number, 138, 144, 147, 149 tidal prediction, 211, 216-18, 220 statistical mechanical systems, 60 Tolstoy, Leo, 560

transport phenomena, 11, 121, 137, 144. See also Reynolds analogy Tribus, Myron, 378, 380, 381n Truth-Directedness, 420 Turing machine, 79–80, 441 Two New Sciences, 70, 72, 74–75. See also Galileo, Galilei Tyndall, John, 111, 327

ultrafilter logic, 17, 522, 568–70
ultrafilter theorem, 565, 567
unified field theory, 72
uniform probability distribution, 16, 382n, 524–25, 527–30, 534–36, 592
uniformitarian geology: and catastrophist theories, 285, 289; as example of abduction, 276, 285–89; similarity to Darwin's argument, 287–88. See also Lyell Charles; Principles of Geology
uniformity of chance, 520, 522–24
uranium: and nuclear fission, 98, 139–40; separation of radium, 26–27
Uranus: anomalous motions of, 311; source of perturbations, 209

value judgments: as criterion for theory choice, 170; ethical judgments of scientists, 155, 162–64; irresolvable, 168. *See also* epistemic values and virtues; values values: as criteria of theory choice, 168; as distinguished from facts, 154; non-epistemic

values: as criteria of theory choice, 168; as distinguished from facts, 154; non-epistemic, 162. See also epistemic values and virtues; value judgments Van Fraassen, Bas, 249

Vossiche Zeitung, 108, 110
Vitali sets: and axiom of choice, 555–56;
construction of, 548–52, 567; chance
properties of, 553–54; defined 521; logic
of 521; as simple nonmeasurable set, 548;
specification of, 554–55
von Mises, Richard, 337, 353–56, 369

von Neumann, John, 195; Mathematical Foundations of Quantum Mechanics, 195 von Seeliger, Hugo, 274–75, 308–09 Vulcan, 210, 308, 310–11

Wagon, Stan, 521, 543, 545 Walker, James, 329–30 Wallace, David, 583–84, 610 Walley, Peter, 359, 373–75 War and Peace, 560. See also Tolstoy, Leo Warren, Robin, 96 Watson, James, 205 wave theory of light: and cathode rays, 290-96; and Darwin, 324; and electromagnetic theory, 329; versus emission theory, 274, 324-30; as example of abduction, 324-330; fit with experimental results, 290, 295-96; multiple theories, 324-25; obstacles facing, 274, 329; versus particle theory, 297-99 Weak Convexity, 409-10 Weinberg, Steven, 314-15 Weintraub, Ruth, 472 Weisskopf, Victor, 140-42 Wenmackers, Sylvia, 472, 477 Weyl, Hermann, 306-07, 311 Whewell, William: and catastrophist theories, 285; and crystallography, 29, 39, 42, 44; and inference to the best explanation, 258-59; History of the Inductive Sciences, 29, 326-27; influence on Darwin, 278; oxygen and phlogiston, 323 white hole, 604 Wickramasinghe, Chandra, 316 Wiedemann, Eilhard, 293 Williamson, Timothy, 472

Worrall, John, 114 Young, Thomas, 326

Zermelo-Fraenkel set theory, 555–56 Zero-One Law, 560 zodiacal light, 210, 274, 308–09 Zorn's lemma, 556

Wilson, Robert, 247, 275, 313, 319, 539

 σ -algebras. See σ -fields σ -fields, 526–31

The fundamental burden of a theory of inductive inference is to determine which are the good inductive inferences or relations of inductive support and why it is that they are so. The traditional approach is modeled on that taken in accounts of deductive inference. It seeks universally applicable schemas or rules or a single formal device, such as the probability calculus. After millennia of halting efforts, none of these approaches has been unequivocally successful and debates between approaches persist.

The Material Theory of Induction identifies the source of these enduring problems in the assumption taken at the outset: that inductive inference can be accommodated by a single formal account with universal applicability. Instead, it argues that that there is no single, universally applicable formal account. Rather, each domain has an inductive logic native to it. The content of that logic and where it can be applied are determined by the facts prevailing in that domain.

Paying close attention to how inductive inference is conducted in science and copiously illustrated with real-world examples, *The Material Theory of Induction* will initiate a new tradition in the analysis of inductive inference.

JOHN D. NORTON is a Distinguished Professor in the Department of History and Philosophy of Science at the University of Pittsburgh. He is cofounder of PhilSci-Archive, a preprint server in the philosophy of science, and of &HPS, a conference series in the integrated history and philosophy of science.



